United States District Court For the Central District of Illinois Criminal Justice Act Plan

# I. Authority

Under the Criminal Justice Act (CJA) of 1964, as amended, 18 U.S.C. § 3006A, and *Guide to Judiciary Policy (Guide)*, Volume 7A, the judges of the United States District Court for the Central District of Illinois adopt this Plan, as approved by the circuit, for furnishing representation in federal court for any person financially unable to obtain adequate representation in accordance with the CJA.

## II. Statement of Policy

A. Objectives

The objectives of this Plan are:

- 1. to attain the goal of equal justice under the law for all persons;
- 2. to provide all eligible persons with timely appointed counsel services that are consistent with the best practices of the legal profession, are cost-effective, and protect the independence of the defense function so that the rights of individual defendants are safeguarded and enforced; and
- 3. to particularize the requirements of the CJA, the USA Patriot Improvement and Reauthorization Act of 2005 (recodified at 18 U.S.C. § 3599), and *Guide*, Vol. 7A, in a way that meets the needs of this district.

This Plan must therefore be administered so that those accused of a crime, or otherwise eligible for services under the CJA, will not be deprived of the right to counsel, or any element of representation necessary to an effective defense, due to lack of financial resources.

- B. Compliance
  - 1. The court, its Clerk, the Federal Public Defender organization, attorneys provided by a bar association or legal aid agency, and private attorneys appointed under the CJA must comply with Guide, Vol. 7A, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States or its Committee on Defender Services, and with this Plan.

2. The Court will ensure that a current copy of the CJA Plan is made available on the Court's website, and provided to CJA counsel upon the attorney's designation as a member of the CJA panel of private attorneys (CJA Panel). The Federal Public Defender will also ensure that a current copy of the CJA Plan is available on its website.

#### III. Definitions

A. Representation

"Representation" includes counsel and investigative, expert, and other services.

B. Appointed Attorney

"Appointed attorney" is an attorney designated to represent a financially eligible person under the CJA and this Plan. Such attorneys include private attorneys, the Federal Public Defender and staff attorneys of the Federal Public Defender organization, and attorneys provided by a bar association or legal aid agency.

C. eVoucher

"eVoucher" is the electronic voucher management system for court appointed attorneys to use to submit fee and expense requests and for judges and court staff to use to review and approve submitted claims.

### IV. Determination of Eligibility for CJA Representation

- A. Subject Matter Eligibility
  - 1. Mandatory

Representation **must** be provided for any financially eligible person who:

- a. is charged with a felony or with a Class A misdemeanor;
- b. is a juvenile alleged to have committed an act of juvenile delinquency as defined in 18 U.S.C. § 5031;
- c. is charged with a violation of probation or supervised release conditions;

- d. is under arrest, when such representation is required by law;
- e. is entitled to appointment of counsel in parole proceedings;
- f. is subject to a mental condition hearing under 18 U.S.C. chapter 313;
- g. is in custody as a material witness;
- h. is seeking to set aside or vacate a death sentence under 28 U.S.C. § 2254 or § 2255;
- i. is entitled to appointment of counsel in verification of consent proceedings in connection with a transfer of an offender to or from the United States for the execution of a penal sentence under 18 U.S.C. § 4109;
- j. is entitled to appointment of counsel under the Sixth Amendment to the Constitution; or
- k. faces loss of liberty in a case and federal law requires the appointment of counsel.
- 2. Discretionary

Whenever a district judge or magistrate judge determines that the interests of justice so require, representation **may** be provided for any financially eligible person who:

- a. is charged with a petty offense (Class B or C misdemeanor, or an infraction) for which a sentence to confinement is authorized;
- b. is seeking relief under 28 U.S.C. §§ 2241, 2254, or 2255 other than to set aside or vacate a death sentence;
- c. is charged with civil or criminal contempt and faces loss of liberty;
- d. has been called as a witness before a grand jury, a court, the Congress, or a federal agency or commission which has the power to compel testimony, and there is reason to believe, either prior to or during testimony, that the

witness could be subject to a criminal prosecution, a civil or criminal contempt proceeding, or face loss of liberty;

- e. has been advised by the United States attorney or a law enforcement officer that they are the target of a grand jury investigation;
- f. is proposed by the United States attorney for processing under a pretrial diversion program; or
- g. is held for international extradition under 18 U.S.C. chapter 209;
- h. made a request for modification of a condition of probation or supervised release which the Probation office denied;
- is subject to conditions of probation or supervised release and the Court, Probation Office, or United States Attorney's Office seeks a modification of said conditions.
- 3. Ancillary Matters

Representation may also be provided for financially eligible persons in ancillary matters appropriate to the criminal proceedings under 18 U.S.C. § 3006A(c). In determining whether representation in an ancillary matter is appropriate to the criminal proceedings, the court should consider whether such representation is reasonably necessary:

- a. to protect a constitutional right;
- b. to contribute in some significant way to the defense of the principal criminal charge;
- c. to aid in preparation for the trial or disposition of the principal criminal charge;
- d. to enforce the terms of a plea agreement in the principal criminal charge;
- e. to preserve the claim of the CJA client to an interest in real or personal property subject to civil forfeiture proceeding under 18 U.S.C. § 983,19 U.S.C. § 1602, 21 U.S.C. § 881, or similar statutes, which property, if recovered by the client, may be considered for reimbursement under 18 U.S.C. § 3006A(f); or

- f. effectuate the return of real or personal property belonging to the CJA client, which may be subject to a motion for return of property under Fed. R. Crim. P. 41(g), which property, if recovered by the client, may be considered for reimbursement under 18 U.S.C. § 3006A(f).
- B. Financial Eligibility
  - 1. The determination of eligibility for representation under the CJA is a judicial function to be performed by a federal judge after making appropriate inquiries concerning the person's financial condition.
  - 2. The presiding judicial officer shall not require a defendant to complete a financial affidavit until after counsel has been appointed. The judicial officer may provisionally appoint counsel for the purposes of assisting the defendant with the completion of a financial affidavit. If after completion of the financial affidavit, the judicial officer concludes the defendant is not eligible for the appointment of counsel, the provisional appointment of counsel shall cease.
  - 3. The federal judge shall, in selecting and appointing counsel, either designate the Federal Public Defender, CJA Panel attorney, or, in death penalty habeas corpus cases, persons whose names are submitted by the Federal Public Defender.
  - 4. If, at any time after appointment, counsel obtains information that a client is financially able to make payment, in whole or in part, for legal or other services in connection with his or her representation, and the source of the attorney's information is not protected as a privileged communication, counsel shall advise the Court.
- V. Timely Appointment of Counsel
  - A. Timing of Appointment

Counsel must be provided to eligible persons:

- 1. when they first appear before a magistrate or district court judge; or
- 2. when a judicial officer otherwise considers appointment of counsel appropriate under the CJA and related statutes.

B. Pretrial Service Interview

The Pretrial Services Interview shall occur after the appointment of counsel. The interview shall be conducted at the courthouse with counsel present and immediately following the defendant's initial appearance, unless some other time or place is agreed upon between the U.S. Probation Office and counsel.

- VI. Provision of Representational Services
  - A. Federal Public Defender and Private Counsel

This Plan provides for representational services by the federal public defender organization and for the appointment and compensation of private counsel from a CJA Panel list maintained by the court in cases authorized under the CJA and related statutes.

B. Administration

Administration of the CJA Panel, as set forth in this Plan, is hereby delegated and assigned to the court.

C. Apportionment of Cases

Where practical and cost effective, private attorneys from the CJA Panel will be appointed in a substantial proportion of the cases in which the accused is determined to be financially eligible for representation under the CJA. "Substantial" will usually be defined as a minimum of twenty-five percent (25%) of the annual CJA appointments.

D. Number of Counsel

More than one attorney may be appointed in any case determined by the court to be extremely difficult.

E. Capital Cases

Procedures for appointment of counsel in cases where the defendant is charged with a crime that may be punishable by death, or is seeking to vacate or set aside a death sentence in proceedings under 28 U.S.C. §§ 2254 or 2255, are set forth in section XIV of this Plan.

- VII. Federal Public Defender Organization
  - A. Establishment

The Federal Public Defender's Office for the Central District of Illinois is established in this district under the CJA and is responsible for rendering defense services on appointment throughout this district.

B. Standards

The Federal Public Defender organization must provide high quality representation consistent with the best practices of the legal profession and commensurate with those services rendered when counsel is privately retained. See *Polk County v. Dodson,* 454 U.S. 312, 318 (1981) ("Once a lawyer has undertaken the representation of an accused, the duties and obligations are the same whether the lawyer is privately retained, appointed, or serving in a legal aid or defender program." (quoting ABA Standards for Criminal Justice section 4-3.9 (2d ed. 1980))).

C. Workload

The Federal Public Defender Organization will continually monitor the workloads of its staff to ensure high quality representation for all clients.

D. Professional Conduct

The Federal Public Defender Organization must conform to the highest standards of professional conduct, including but not limited to the Illinois Rules of Professional Conduct and the Code of Conduct for Federal Public Defender Employees.

E. Private Practice of Law

Neither the Federal Public Defender nor any defender employee may engage in the private practice of law except as authorized by the Federal Public Defender Code of Conduct.

F. Supervision of Defender Organization

The Federal Public Defender will be responsible for the supervision and management of the Federal Public Defender Organization. Accordingly, the Federal Public Defender will be appointed in all cases assigned to that organization for subsequent assignment to staff attorneys at the discretion of the Federal Public Defender.

G. Training

The Federal Public Defender will assess the training needs of Federal Public Defender staff and, in coordination with the CJA Panel Attorney

District Representative, the training needs of the local panel attorneys, and provide training opportunities and other educational resources.

- VIII. CJA Panel of Private Attorneys
  - A. Establishment of the CJA Panel Committee
    - 1. A CJA Panel Committee ("CJA Committee") will be established by the Court in consultation with the Federal Public Defender. The CJA Committee will consist of the chief district court judge, one magistrate judge, the federal public defender, and the CJA Panel Attorney District Representative (PADR). The chief district judge shall be the chairperson. There shall be a sub-panel in each division appointed by the chief district judge consisting of the presiding district judge, one magistrate judge, one assigned assistant federal public defender for the division, and one attorney who is willing to serve on the CJA panel. The presiding district judge shall be the chairperson.
    - 2. The federal public defender or their representative, and the district's PADR are permanent members of the CJA Committee.
    - 3. The CJA Committee will meet at least once a year and at any time the court asks the Committee to consider an issue.
  - B. Duties of the CJA Committee
    - 1. Membership

Examine the qualifications of applicants for membership on the CJA Panel as recommended by each sub-panel and recommend to the chief judge the approval of those attorneys who are deemed qualified and the rejection of the applications of those attorneys deemed unqualified.

2. Recruitment

Engage in recruitment efforts to establish a diverse panel and ensure that all qualified attorneys are encouraged to participate in the furnishing of representation in CJA cases.

3. Annual Report

Review the operation and administration of the CJA Panel over the preceding year, and recommend any necessary or appropriate changes to the chief judge concerning:

- a. the size of the CJA Panel;
- b. the recruitment of qualified and diverse attorneys as required and set forth in this plan; and
- 4. recurring issues or difficulties encountered by panel members or their CJA clients.
- 5. Removal

Recommend to the chief judge the removal of any CJA panel member who:

- a. fails to satisfactorily fulfill the requirements of CJA panel membership during their term of service, including the failure to provide high quality representation to CJA clients, or
- b. has engaged in other conduct such that his or her continued service on the CJA Panel is inappropriate.
- 6. Training

Assist the Federal Public Defender office in providing training for the CJA Panel on substantive and procedural legal matters affecting representation of CJA clients.

7. Voucher Review

If requested by a district judge, review and make recommendations on the processing and payment of CJA vouchers in those cases where the court, for reasons other than mathematical errors, is considering authorizing payment for less than the amount of compensation claimed by CJA counsel. The judge will, at the time the voucher is submitted to the CJA Committee, provide a statement describing questions or concerns they have with the voucher. Counsel will be notified of the potential voucher reduction and given the opportunity to provide information or documentation relevant to the voucher and concerns raised by the judge. The CJA Committee will issue a written recommendation to the judge.

8. Mentoring

Appoint experienced CJA panel members to serve on a

subcommittee to create and administer a mentoring program designed to identify and help prepare viable candidates to qualify for consideration for appointment to the CJA Panel. Experienced members of the criminal defense bar who have practiced extensively in the federal courts will be selected to serve as mentors. The subcommittee will review the mentee applications, make recommendations concerning their participation in the mentoring program, identify appropriate cases for the mentoring program, evaluate the success of the mentoring program, and provide guidance to the mentors.

- IX. Establishment of a CJA Panel
  - A. Approval of CJA Panel
    - 1. The existing, previously established panel of attorneys who are eligible and willing to be appointed to provide representation under the CJA is hereby recognized.
    - 2. The chair of the CJA Committee will approve attorneys for membership on the CJA Panel after receiving recommendations from the CJA Committee.
  - B. Size of CJA Panel
    - The size of the CJA Panel will be determined by the CJA Committee based on the caseload and activity of the panel members, subject to review by the court.
    - 2. The CJA Panel must be large enough to provide a sufficient number of experienced attorneys to handle the CJA caseload, yet small enough so that CJA panel members will receive an adequate number of appointments to maintain their proficiency in federal criminal defense work enabling them to provide high quality representation consistent with the best practices of the legal profession and commensurate with those services rendered when counsel is privately retained.
  - C. Qualifications and Membership on the CJA Panel
    - 1. Application

Application forms for membership on the CJA Panel are available on the Federal Public Defender's website, ilc.fd.org, at the "CJA RESOURCES" tab. 2. Equal Opportunity

All qualified attorneys are encouraged to participate in the furnishing of representation in CJA cases.

- 3. Eligibility
  - a. Applicants for the CJA Panel must be admitted to practice in the Central District of Illinois.
  - b. Applicants must maintain a primary, satellite, or shared office in this district, or, for CJA Panel attorneys in the Rock Island Division, in the Southern District of Iowa
  - c. Applicants must possess strong litigation skills and demonstrate proficiency with the federal sentencing guidelines, federal sentencing procedures, the Bail Reform Act, the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure, and the Federal Rules of Evidence.
  - d. Applicants must have significant experience representing persons charged with serious criminal offenses and demonstrate a commitment to the defense of people who lack the financial means to hire an attorney.
  - e. Attorneys who do not possess the experience set forth above but believe they have equivalent other experience are encouraged to apply and set forth in writing the details of that experience for the CJA Committee's consideration.
- 4. Appointment to CJA Panel

After considering the recommendations of the sub-panels and the CJA Committee, the chief judge will appoint or reappoint attorneys to the CJA Panel.

- 5. Due to the highly complex and demanding nature of capital and habeas corpus cases, special procedures will be followed for the eligibility and appointment of counsel in such cases. See Section XIV of this Plan.
- 6. CJA Training Panel

The CJA Committee may establish a "CJA Training Panel" consisting of attorneys who do not have the experience required for membership on the CJA Panel. Training Panel members may be assigned, by the Court, to assist members of the CJA Panel in a "second chair" capacity. Training Panel members are not eligible to receive appointments independently, and shall not be eligible to receive compensation for their services in assisting CJA Panel members without the approval of the presiding district judge. Prior service on the CJA Training Panel is not a requirement for membership on the CJA Panel, nor will service on the Training Panel guarantee admission of an attorney to the CJA Panel.

- 7. Reappointment of CJA Panel Members
  - a. A member of the CJA Panel who wishes to be considered for reappointment must complete an "Annual Certification for Continued Membership on the CJA Panel" by January 1st of each calendar year. The form is available on the Federal Public Defender's website, ilc.fd.org, under the "CJA RESOURCES" tab. Failure to submit an Annual Certification form will result in the member being removed from the CJA Panel.
  - b. The CJA Committee will solicit input concerning the quality of representation provided by lawyers seeking reappointment.
  - c. The CJA Committee also will consider how many cases the CJA panel member has accepted and declined during the review period, whether the member has participated in training opportunities, whether the member has been the subject of any complaints, and whether the member continues to meet the prerequisites and obligations of CJA panel members as set forth in this Plan.
- 8. Removal from the CJA Panel
  - a. Mandatory removal

Any member of the CJA Panel who is suspended or disbarred from the practice of law by the state court before whom such member is admitted, or who is suspended or disbarred from this court or any federal court, will be removed from the CJA Panel immediately.

b. Automatic disciplinary review

The CJA Committee will conduct an automatic disciplinary review of any CJA panel member against whom any licensing authority, grievance committee, or administrative body has taken action, or when a finding of probable cause, contempt, sanction, or reprimand has been issued against the panel member by any state or federal court.

- c. Complaints
  - (i) Initiation

A complaint against a panel member may be initiated by the CJA Committee, a judge, another panel member, a defendant, or a member of the Federal Public Defender office. A complaint need not follow any particular form, but it must be in writing and state the alleged deficiency with specificity. Any complaint should be directed to the CJA Committee, which will determine whether further investigation is necessary.

(ii) Notice

When conducting an investigation, the CJA Committee will notify the panel member of the specific allegations.

(iii) Response

A panel member subject to investigation may respond in writing and appear, if so directed, before the CJA Committee or its subcommittee.

(iv) Protective action

Prior to disposition of any complaint, the CJA Committee may recommend temporary suspension or removal of the panel member from any pending case, or from the panel, and may take any other protective action that is in the best interest of the client or the administration of this Plan.

(v) Review and recommendation

After investigation, the CJA Committee may recommend dismissing the complaint, or recommend appropriate remedial action, including removing the attorney from the panel, limiting the attorney's participation to particular types or categories of cases, directing the attorney to complete specific CLE requirements before receiving further panel appointments, limiting the attorney's participation to handling cases that are directly supervised or overseen by another panel member or other experienced practitioner, or any other appropriate remedial action.

(vi) Final disposition by the court

The CJA Committee will forward its recommendation to the chief judge for consideration and final disposition.

(vii) Confidentiality

Unless otherwise directed by the court, any information acquired concerning any possible disciplinary action, including any complaint and any related proceeding, will be confidential.

- (viii) None of these procedures create a property interest in being on or remaining on the CJA Panel.
- d. Notification

The Federal Public Defender will be immediately notified when any member of the CJA Panel is removed or suspended.

- X. CJA Panel Attorney Appointment in Non-Capital Cases
  - A. Appointment List

The Federal Public Defender office will maintain a current list of all attorneys included on the CJA Panel, with current office addresses, email addresses, and telephone numbers, as well as a statement of qualifications and experience. The Federal Public Defender shall provide the Court with an updated list when changes are made.

- B. Appointment Procedures
  - 1. The Court is responsible for overseeing the appointment of cases to panel attorneys. The Court will maintain a record of panel attorney appointments and, when appropriate, data reflecting the apportionment of appointments between attorneys from the Federal Public Defender office and panel attorneys.
  - 2. Appointment of cases to CJA panel members will ordinarily be made on a rotational basis. In a complex or otherwise difficult case, the Court may appoint counsel outside of the normal rotation to ensure the defendant has sufficiently experienced counsel.
  - 3. Under special circumstances the court may appoint a member of the bar of the court who is not a member of the CJA Panel. Such special circumstances may include cases in which the court determines that the appointment of a particular attorney is in the interests of justice, judicial economy, or continuity of representation, or for any other compelling reason. It is not anticipated that special circumstances will arise often, and the procedures set forth in the Plan are presumed to be sufficient in the vast majority of cases in which counsel are to be appointed. Appointments made under this section will be reported to the CJA Committee.
  - 4. Unless otherwise impracticable, CJA panel attorney(s) must be available to represent defendant(s) at the same stage of the proceedings as is the Federal Public Defender.
- XI. Duties of CJA Panel Members
  - A. Standards and Professional Conduct
    - 1. CJA panel members must provide high quality representation consistent with the best practices of the legal profession and commensurate with those services rendered when counsel is privately retained. See *Polk County v. Dodson*, 454 U.S. 312, 318 (1981) ("'Once a lawyer has undertaken the representation of an accused, the duties and obligations are the same whether the lawyer is privately retained, appointed, or serving in a legal aid or defender program.'" (quoting ABA Standards for Criminal Justice section 4-3.9 (2d ed. 1980))).

- 2. Attorneys appointed under the CJA must conform to the highest standards of professional conduct, including but not limited to the Illinois Rules of Professional Conduct.
- 3. CJA panel members must notify within 30 days the chair of the CJA Committee when any licensing authority, grievance committee, or administrative body has taken action against them, or when a finding of contempt, sanction, or reprimand has been issued against the panel member by any state of federal court.
- B. Training and Continuing Legal Education
  - 1. Attorneys on the CJA Panel are expected to remain current with developments in federal criminal defense law, practice, and procedure, including the Recommendation for Electronically Stored Information (ESI) Discovery Production in Federal Criminal Cases.
  - 2. Attorneys on the CJA Panel are expected to attend trainings sponsored by the Federal Public Defender.
  - 3. Attorneys on the CJA Panel will be guided in their practice by the Federal Adaptation of the National Legal Aid and Defender Association Performance Guidelines for Criminal Defense Representations.
  - 4. CJA panel members must attend at least four continuing legal education hours relevant to federal criminal practice annually.
  - 5. Failure to comply with these training and legal education requirements may be grounds for removal from the CJA Panel.
- C. Facilities and Technology Requirements
  - 1. CJA panel attorneys must have facilities, resources, and technological capability to effectively and efficiently manage assigned cases.
  - 2. CJA panel attorneys must comply with the requirements of electronic filing and eVoucher.
  - 3. CJA panel attorneys must know and abide by procedures related to requests for investigative, expert, and other services.
- D. Continuing Representation

Once counsel is appointed under the CJA, counsel will continue the representation until the matter, including appeals (unless provided otherwise by the Seventh Circuit's CJA plan) or review by certiorari, is closed; or until substitute counsel has filed a notice of appearance; or until an order is entered allowing or requiring the person represented to proceed pro se; or until the appointment is terminated by court order.

- E. Miscellaneous
  - 1. Case budgeting

In non-capital representations of unusual complexity that are likely to become extraordinary in terms of cost, the court may require development of a case budget consistent with *Guide*, Vol. 7A, Ch. 2, §§ 230.26.10–20.

2. No receipt of other payment

Appointed counsel may not require, request, or accept any payment or promise of payment or any other valuable consideration for representation under the CJA, unless such payment is approved by order of the court.

3. Redetermination of need

If at any time after appointment, counsel has reason to believe that a party is financially able to obtain counsel, or make partial payment for counsel, and the source of counsel's information is not protected as a privileged communication, counsel will advise the court.

- XII. Compensation of CJA Panel Attorneys
  - A. Policy of the Court Regarding Compensation

Providing fair compensation to appointed counsel is a critical component of the administration of justice. CJA panel attorneys must be compensated for time expended in court and time reasonably expended out of court, and reimbursed for expenses reasonably incurred.

- B. Voucher cuts should be limited to:
  - 1. Mathematical errors;
  - 2. Instances in which work billed was not compensable;

- 3. Instances in which work was not undertaken or completed; and
- 4. Instances in which the hours billed are clearly in excess of what was reasonably required to complete the task
- C. Payment Procedures
  - 1. Claims for compensation must be submitted on the appropriate CJA form through the court's eVoucher system.
  - 2. Claims for compensation should be submitted no later than 45 days after final disposition of the case, unless good cause is shown.
  - 3. The Court or their designee will review the claim for mathematical and technical accuracy and for conformity with *Guide*, Vol. 7A and, if correct, will forward the claim for consideration and action by the presiding judge.
  - 4. Absent extraordinary circumstances, the court should act on CJA compensation claims within 30 days of submission, and vouchers should not be delayed or reduced for the purpose of diminishing Defender Services program costs in response to adverse financial circumstances.
  - 5. Except in cases involving mathematical corrections, no claim for compensation submitted for services provided under the CJA will be reduced without affording counsel notice and the opportunity to be heard.
  - 6. The court, when contemplating reduction of a CJA voucher for other than mathematical reasons, may refer the voucher to the CJA Committee or the Federal Public Defender for review and recommendation before final action on the claim is taken.
  - 7. Notwithstanding the procedure described above, the court may, in the first instance, contact appointed counsel to inquire regarding questions or concerns with a claim for compensation. In the event that the matter is resolved to the satisfaction of the court and CJA panel member, the claim for compensation need not be referred for review and recommendation.
- D. Independent Review Process

- 1. The District shall create an independent review process for panel attorneys who wish to challenge any reductions to vouchers that have been made by the presiding judge.
- 2. Any challenged reduction should be subject to review consistent with this independent review process.
- 3. All processes implemented by the District shall be consistent with the statutory requirements for fixing compensation and reimbursement to be paid under 18 U.S.C. 3006A(d).
- XIII. Investigative, Expert, and Other Services
  - A. Financial Eligibility

Counsel for a person who is financially unable to obtain investigative, expert, or other services necessary for an adequate defense may request such services in an *ex parte* application to the court as provided in 18 U.S.C. § 3006A(e)(1), regardless of whether counsel is appointed under the CJA. Upon finding that the services are necessary, and that the person is financially unable to obtain them, the court must authorize counsel to obtain the services.

B. Applications

Requests for authorization of funds for investigative, expert, and other services must be submitted in an *ex parte* application to the court (using the court's eVoucher system) and must not be disclosed except with the consent of the person represented or as required by law or Judicial Conference policy.

C. Compliance

Counsel must comply with Judicial Conference policies set forth in *Guide*, Vol. 7A, Ch. 3.

### XIV. Appointment of Counsel and Case Management in CJA Capital Cases

A. Applicable Legal Authority

The appointment and compensation of counsel in capital cases and the authorization and payment of persons providing investigative, expert, and other services are governed by 18 U.S.C. §§ 3005, 3006A, and 3599, and *Guide*, Vol. 7A, Ch. 6.

- B. General Applicability and Appointment of Counsel Requirements
  - 1. Unless otherwise specified, the provisions set forth in this section apply to all capital proceedings in the federal courts, whether those matters originated in a district court (federal capital trials) or in a state court (habeas proceedings under 28 U.S.C. § 2254). Such matters include those in which the death penalty may be or is being sought by the prosecution, motions for a new trial, direct appeal, applications for a writ of certiorari to the Supreme Court of the United States, all post-conviction proceedings under 28 U.S.C. §§ 2254 or 2255 seeking to vacate or set aside a death sentence, applications for stays of execution, competency proceedings, proceedings for executive or other clemency, and other appropriate motions and proceedings.
  - 2. Any person charged with a crime that may be punishable by death who is or becomes financially unable to obtain representation is entitled to the assistance of appointed counsel throughout every stage of available judicial proceedings, including pretrial proceedings, trial, sentencing, motions for new trial, appeals, applications for writ of certiorari to the Supreme Court of the United States, and all available post-conviction processes, together with applications for stays of execution and other appropriate motions and procedures, competency proceedings, and proceedings for executive or other clemency as may be available to the defendant. See 18 U.S.C. § 3599(e).
  - 3. Qualified counsel must be appointed in capital cases at the earliest possible opportunity.
  - 4. Given the complex and demanding nature of capital cases, where appropriate, the court will utilize the expert services available through the Administrative Office of the United States

Courts (AO), Defender Services Death Penalty Resource Counsel projects ("Resource Counsel projects") which include: (1) Federal Death Penalty Resource Counsel and Capital Resource Counsel Projects (for federal capital trials), (2) Federal Capital Appellate Resource Counsel Project, (3) Federal Capital Habeas § 2255 Project, and (4) National and Regional Habeas Assistance and Training Counsel Projects (§ 2254). These counsel are death penalty experts who may be relied upon by the court for assistance with selection and appointment of counsel, case budgeting, and legal, practical, and other matters arising in federal capital cases.

- 5. The Federal Public Defender should promptly notify and consult with the appropriate Resource Counsel projects about potential and actual federal capital trial, appellate, and habeas corpus cases, and consider their recommendations for appointment of counsel.
- 6. In appointing counsel in capital cases, judges should consider and give due weight to the recommendations made by federal defenders and resource counsel and articulate reasons for not doing so.
- 7. The presiding judge may appoint an attorney furnished by a state or local public defender organization or legal aid agency or other private, non-profit organization to represent a person charged with a capital crime or seeking federal death penalty habeas corpus relief provided that the attorney is fully qualified. Such appointments may be in place of, or in addition to, the appointment of a federal defender organization or a CJA panel attorney or an attorney appointed pro hac vice. See 18 U.S.C. § 3006A(a)(3).
- 8. All attorneys appointed in federal capital cases must be well qualified, by virtue of their training, commitment, and distinguished prior capital defense experience at the relevant stage of the proceeding, to serve as counsel in this highly specialized and demanding litigation.
- 9. All attorneys appointed in federal capital cases must have sufficient time and resources to devote to the representation,

taking into account their current caseloads and the extraordinary demands of federal capital cases.

- 10. All attorneys appointed in federal capital cases should comply with the American Bar Association's 2003 Guidelines for the Appointment and Performance of Defense Counsel in Death Penalty Cases (Guidelines 1.1 and 10.2 et seq.), and the 2008 Supplementary Guidelines for the Mitigation Function of Defense Teams in Death Penalty Cases.
- 11. All attorneys appointed in federal capital cases should consult regularly with the appropriate Resource Counsel projects.
- 12. There should be no formal or informal non-statutory budgetary caps on capital cases, whether in a capital trial, direct appeal, or habeas matter.
- 13. All capital cases should be budgeted with the assistance of casebudgeting attorneys and/or resource counsel where appropriate.
- 14. Questions about the appointment and compensation of counsel and the authorization and payment of investigative, expert, and other service providers in federal capital cases should be directed to the AO Defender Services Office, Legal and Policy Division Duty Attorney at 202-502-3030 or via email at <u>ods\_lpb@ao.uscourts.gov.</u>
- C. Appointment of Trial Counsel in Federal Death-Eligible Cases
  - 1. General Requirements
    - a. Appointment of qualified capital trial counsel must occur no later than when a defendant is charged with a federal criminal offense where the penalty of death is possible. See 18 U.S.C. § 3005.
    - b. To protect the rights of an individual who, although uncharged, is the subject of an investigation in a federal death-eligible case, the court may appoint capitallyqualified counsel upon request, consistent with Sections C.1, 2, and 3 of these provisions.
    - c. At the outset of every capital case, the court must appoint two attorneys, at least one of whom meets the

qualifications for "learned counsel" as described below. If necessary for adequate representation, more than two attorneys may be appointed to represent a defendant in a capital case. See 18 U.S.C. § 3005.

- d. When appointing counsel, the judge must consider the recommendation of the Federal Public Defender, who will consult with Federal Death Penalty Resource Counsel to recommend qualified counsel.
- e. In appointing counsel, judge should give due weight to the recommendations made by federal defenders and resource counsel and articulate reasons for not doing so.
- f. To effectuate the intent of 18 U.S.C. § 3005 that the Federal Public Defender's recommendation be provided to the court, the judge should ensure the Federal Public defender has been notified of the need to appoint capitally-qualified counsel.
- g. Reliance on a list for appointment of capital counsel is not recommended because selection of trial counsel should account for the particular needs of the case and the defendant, and be based on individualized recommendations from the Federal Public Defender in conjunction with the Federal Death Penalty Resource Counsel and Capital Resource Counsel projects.
- h. Out-of-district counsel, including federal defender organization staff, who possess the requisite expertise may be considered for appointment in capital trials to achieve high quality representation together with cost and other efficiencies.
- In evaluating the qualifications of proposed trial counsel, consideration should be given to their commitment to the defense of capital cases, their current caseload including other capital cases, and their willingness to effectively represent the interests of the client.
- 2. Qualifications of Learned Counsel
  - a. Learned counsel must either be a member of this district's bar or be eligible for admission pro hac vice

based on his or her qualifications. Appointment of counsel from outside the jurisdiction is common in federal capital cases to achieve cost and other efficiencies together with high quality representation.

- b. Learned counsel must meet the minimum experience standards set forth in 18 U.S.C. §§ 3005 and 3599.
- c. Learned counsel should have distinguished prior experience in the trial, appeal, or post-conviction review of federal death penalty cases, or distinguished prior experience in state death penalty trials, appeals, or postconviction review that, in combination with co-counsel, will assure high quality representation.
- d. "Distinguished prior experience" contemplates excellence, not simply prior experience. Counsel with distinguished prior experience should be appointed even if meeting this standard requires appointing counsel from outside the district where the matter arises.
- e. The suitability of learned counsel should be assessed with respect to the particular demands of the case, the stage of the litigation, and the defendant.
- f. Learned counsel must be willing and able to adjust other caseload demands to accommodate the extraordinary time required by the capital representation.
- g. Learned counsel should satisfy the qualification standards endorsed by bar associations and other legal organizations regarding the quality of representation in capital cases.
- 3. Qualifications of Second and Additional Counsel
  - Second and additional counsel may, but are not required to, satisfy the qualifications for learned counsel, as set forth above.
  - Second and additional counsel must be well qualified, by virtue of their distinguished prior criminal defense experience, training and commitment, to serve as

counsel in this highly specialized and demanding litigation.

- c. Second and additional counsel must be willing and able to adjust other caseload demands to accommodate the extraordinary time required by the capital representation.
- d. The suitability of second and additional counsel should be assessed with respect to the demands of the individual case, the stage of the litigation, and the defendant.
- D. Appointment and Qualifications of Post-Conviction Counsel in Federal Death Penalty Cases (28 U.S.C. § 2255)
  - 1. A financially eligible person seeking to vacate or set aside a death sentence in proceedings under 28 U.S.C. § 2255 is entitled to appointment of fully qualified counsel. See 18 U.S.C. § 3599(a)(2).
  - 2. Due to the complex, demanding, and protracted nature of death penalty proceedings, the court should consider appointing at least two attorneys.
  - In light of the accelerated timeline applicable to capital § 2255 proceedings, prompt appointment of counsel is essential.
    Wherever possible, appointment should take place prior to the denial of certiorari on direct appeal by the United States Supreme Court.
  - 4. When appointing counsel in a capital § 2255 matter, the court should consider the recommendation of the Federal Public Defender, who will consult with the Federal Capital Habeas § 2255 Project.
  - 5. In appointing post-conviction counsel, judges should give due weight to the recommendations made by federal defenders and resource counsel and articulate reasons for not doing so.
  - 6. Out-of-district counsel, including federal defender organization staff, who possess the requisite expertise may be considered for appointment in capital § 2255 cases to achieve high quality representation together with cost and other efficiencies.

- 7. Local or circuit restrictions prohibiting capital habeas units (CHUs) from engaging in cross-district or cross-circuit representation should not be imposed without good cause. Every district should have access to a CHU.
- 8. Counsel in § 2255 cases should have distinguished prior experience in the area of federal post-conviction proceedings and in capital post-conviction proceedings.
- 9. When possible, post-conviction counsel should have distinguished prior experience in capital § 2255 representations.
- 10. In evaluating the qualifications of proposed post-conviction counsel, consideration should be given to the qualification standards endorsed by bar associations and other legal organizations regarding the quality of legal representation in capital cases.
- 11. In evaluating the qualifications of proposed post-conviction § 2255 counsel, consideration should be given to their commitment to the defense of capital cases, their current caseload including other capital cases, and their willingness to effectively represent the interests of the client.
- E. Appointment and Qualifications of Counsel in Federal Capital Habeas Corpus Proceedings (28 U.S.C. § 2254)
  - A financially eligible person seeking to vacate or set aside a death sentence in proceedings under 28 U.S.C. § 2254 is entitled to the appointment of qualified counsel. See 18 U.S.C. § 3599(a)(2).
  - 2. Due to the complex, demanding, and protracted nature of death penalty proceedings, the court should consider appointing at least two attorneys.
  - 3. When appointing counsel in a capital § 2254 matter, the appointing authority should consider the recommendation of the Federal Public Defender who will consult with the National or Regional Habeas Assistance and Training Counsel projects
  - 4. In appointing counsel in a capital 2254 matter, judges should give due weight to the recommendations made by federal

defenders and resource counsel and articulate reasons for not doing so.

- 5. Local or circuit restricts prohibiting Capital Habeas Units (CHUs) from engaging in cross-district or cross-circuit representation should not be imposed without good cause. Every district should have access to a CHU.
- 6. Out-of-district counsel, including federal defender organization staff, who possess the requisite expertise may be considered for appointment in capital 2254 cases to achieve cost and other efficiencies together with high quality representation.
- 7. For federal counsel to avail themselves of the full statute of limitations period to prepare a petition, the court should appoint counsel and provide appropriate litigation resources at the earliest possible time permissible by law.
- 8. Unless precluded by a conflict of interest, or replaced by similarly qualified counsel upon motion by the attorney or motion by the defendant, capital § 2254 counsel must represent the defendant throughout every subsequent stage of available judicial proceedings and all available post-conviction processes, together with applications for stays of execution and other appropriate motions and procedures, and must also represent the defendant in such competency proceedings and proceedings for executive or other clemency as may be available to the defendant. See 18 U.S.C. § 3599(e).
- 9. Counsel in capital § 2254 cases should have distinguished prior experience in the area of federal post-conviction proceedings and in capital post-conviction proceedings.
- 10. When possible, capital § 2254 counsel should have distinguished prior experience in capital § 2254 representations.
- 11. In evaluating the qualifications of proposed capital § 2254 counsel, consideration should be given to the qualification standards endorsed by bar associations and other legal organizations regarding the quality of legal representation in capital cases.

- 12. In evaluating the qualifications of proposed capital § 2254 counsel, consideration should be given to proposed counsel's commitment to the defense of capital cases, their current caseload including other capital cases, and their willingness to represent effectively the interests of the client.
- XV. Effective Date

This Plan will become effective when approved by the Judicial Council of the Seventh Circuit.

ENTER FOR THE COURT ON THIS 13th day of November, 2019.

s/ Sara Darrow

CHIEF JUDGE, DISTRICT COURT

\*APPROVED BY THE JUDICIAL COUNCIL OF THE SEVENTH CIRCUIT ON DECEMBER 17, 2019.